



**State of Palestine**

**State Audit & Administrative  
Control Bureau**

**Executive Summary  
Annual Report  
2016**

**Control & Audit for Construction, Development &  
Good Governance Enhancement**

# SAACB STRATEGY (2017-2021)

## Vision

**Typical audit institution that makes a difference in the lives of citizens**

## Mission

**Effective audit over public resources and public services to ensure sound financial and administrative performance of audited entities, and present professional reports and opinions to stakeholders**

## Core Values

**Integrity**

**Innovation**

**Professional Excellence**

**Transparency**

**Independence**

**Objectivity**

## Table of Content

Foreword .....	-4-
Introduction .....	-7-
Executive Summary .....	-9-

## *Foreword*

As years go by, and at promising and steady pace, State Audit & Administrative Control Bureau is becoming an institution with outstanding attention by all dealing with audit outputs and outcomes, within established audit powers to ensure proper financial and administrative actions, and proper use of public funds in designated purposes. Audit has become a basic pillar that ensures proper measures and actions for public funds management, which in turn forms the basic cornerstone for the state's institutional performance, the watchful eye over the public actions system and the compass leading the safe use of public funds, the shield with which the state protects institutions and interests of people.



As the Bureau is keen for quality of control performance, it explores needs of the public and measures effectiveness and efficiency of government services quality. This is done by improving to quality of services provided to the public, increasing response of public institutions to the public needs, with equality and justice guaranteed for access to these services, and ensure effectiveness of the government on basis of accountability, transparency and good investment in available resources.

This report:

- Contains accurate presentations of audit achievements, 2016 brought by audits at 114 entities.
- Presents major financial and administrative-related observations and misstatements.
- Examines/investigates reasons of shortcomings.
- Discloses financial, administrative and legal violations committed by staff during the course of action that undermine performance of public service.
- Considers complaints or media reports about negligence, ignorance, mismanagements or misuse.

463 complaints and cases have been followed up, and recommendations and constructive proposals have been presented to improve performance, and correct actions and mistakes, which positively enhances institutional action. Many audited entities have taken our observations seriously, where %59 of errors mentioned in audit recommendations and complaints was corrected. Other entities are still considering and deliberating some issues of interest and continuous follow up by

us, which led to unbiased performance, objective findings and transparent recommendations of the Bureau.

In agreement with orientation of the Palestinian leadership to enhance sovereignty and gain more international recognition of the State of Palestine, right of the Palestinian people to join international organizations and raise international status of Palestine, and enhancing integrated local effort; the Bureau was able to attain prestigious status among supreme audit institutions through adherence to advanced work methods in line with the best international practices/standards. This was culminated with INTOSAI membership, which increased international trust in reports the Bureau releases. This will also furnish opportunity to participate in INTOSAI policy making process, assume pivotal role in activities, build/increase capacity of staff and develop technical and academic experience.

The Bureau will keep providing technical and professional help in accounting, audit and legal respects to audited entities, enhancing internal control systems they have, advising and guiding regulatory and administrative processes, expressing professional opinion regarding action appropriateness and legality of agreements, considering law and regulation drafts and raising control awareness and public funds preservation among the public.

In light of the parliament's inactivity and impacts this brought to actions of the Bureau, the latter received great and continuous attention and support from the Mr. President and Mr. Prime Minister. This was evident through complying with requirements of the Bureau in order to facilitate practice of control powers, which is an incentive and inspiration to develop actions, improve performance continuously and circulate integrity, transparency and corruption fighting.

The Bureau is looking for approval to amended law draft presented to council of ministers in agreement with INTOSAI requirements, to which the Bureau became a member early 2017. This would enhance role it plays and quality of actions, which means a positive influence to public performance improvement in the use of public resources and good governance enhancement.

Despite recognizing the volume of challenges and impediments we face, we are persistent towards our vision: typical and excellent audit institution operates as per the highest professional standards, and responds to aspirations of the state and the public. The Bureau has an important role to improve performance of public funds use, through fulfillment of mission entrusted: deliver effective control over public resources to ensure compliance with applicable legislations, ensure proper financial and administrative performance at audited entities, present professional

and highly credible reports to decision makers in the State of Palestine to increase good governance principles in Palestine.

Based on powers vested in us by law, it's my pleasure to present the annual report of 2016, hoping it helps decision makers at the Palestinian institutions to pay necessary attention to audit report, outcomes and recommendations, take necessary corrective measures to control and rationalize spending and ensure these entities would realize objectives of establishment effectively, efficiently and economically.

Finally, I would like to extend thanks, appreciation and respect to all staff members for effort they made in setting this report and performing all tasks entrusted. The Bureau shall remain the pioneer and leader of professional control actions, and the honest guard of public funds.

**'Say: 'Allah will see your works and so will His Messenger and the believers'  
Al-Tawba, 105**

**Respectfully Yours,**

**Counselor Eyad Tayyem  
President  
State Audit & Administrative Control Bureau**

## ***Introduction***

The annual report, 2016 is released in compliance with principles of transparent presentation and disclosure, and the enforcement of SAACB law 15/2005, article (8): **‘President of the Bureau shall present annual report, or report upon request, containing actions and observations to Palestine National Authority President, Legislative Council and council of ministers. President of the Bureau shall provide President of the Palestine National Authority, Legislative Council and council of ministers with any data, information, studies or researches required, and shall undertake any actions they assign. The annual report shall be published in the official gazette’.**

The report is meant to ensure proper financial actions and proper public funds use in designated purposes, and to establish clear procedures, reliable presentation of information, good enforcement of accountability systems and increase the public trust in actions of the government and public sector entities, through empowerment of the public sector management officials to respond to audit findings and take proper corrective actions. The reports also aims at:

- Increasing trust of society.
- Introducing changes to public sector.
- Disclosing misuse of public resources and properties.
- Supporting preventive corruption fighting measures.
- Ensuring adherence to laws, regulations and internal/external codes.
- Improving governance tools.
- Raising level of performance.
- Increasing transparent, clear and credible information given by audited entities.
- Ensuring available correct information to stakeholders at the highest level of accuracy and truth, and in due course.

The report is an essential tool for accountability and correction for audited entities, through contribution to improvement of the state’s financial management, raise efficient performance of audited entities, to enable them set in action the planned objectives effectively, efficiently and economically, all to bring financial and administrative discipline to public performance, and help audited entities improve shortcomings, develop performance and ensure proper response to challenges the people face.

The report depended on information and data taken from reports set by field audit teams during 2016, which have been categorized and analyzed as per the best international practices, through updated academic method of action.

The report consists of three chapters as well as appendixes, so it fully explains audit tasks and powers carried out by the Bureau in 2016. **Chapter (I)** presents audit findings and is divided into six sections:

1. Key findings of regulatory audits at audited entities by sector.
2. Key findings of performance audits
3. Issues with suspected corruption and actions taken.
4. Key recommendations that help correct performance.
5. Follow up to recommendations.
6. Feedback from audited entities to reports of the Bureau.

**Chapter (II)** lists summary audit reports by audit sector. **Chapter (III)** presents key achievements and non-audit activities such as institutional building, capacity development, public relations and resources of the Bureau.

The report has been set with integrated effort by staff of the Bureau, where revision, analysis and audit were undertaken with high level of professional experience. We hope that content of this report would be given more attention by decision makers in the State of Palestine. The Bureau welcomes all constructive observations and suggestions that help develop and support audits at Palestinian institutions, and reach/establish the state of institutions and law.

# **Annual Report 2016**

## **Executive Summary**

The Bureau released the annual report, 2016 pursuant to legal requirement stated in law 15/2004, article (8): **‘President of the Bureau shall present annual report, or report upon request, containing actions and observations to Palestine National Authority President, Legislative Council and council of ministers. President of the Bureau shall provide President of the Palestine National Authority, Legislative Council and council of ministers with any data, information, studies or researches required, and shall undertake any actions they assign. The annual report shall be published in the official gazette’**. The report has also been given driven by the Bureau’s commitment to present data and information on actions undertaken to enhance transparency and accountability.

Data and information contained in the report have been reached through audits at entities, and professional opinion was expressed according to international public sector audit standards, INTOSAI standards and ARABOSAI standards, taking into account observations brought by audited entities’ responses to reports given in 2016.

The reports addresses all key financial/administrative observations mentioned in reports on sectors of economy, social and cultural services, infrastructure, governance/security, local government and NGOs.

The annual report, 2016 is composed of three chapters plus appendices. **Chapter (I)** fully explains audit tasks and powers carried out by the Bureau in 2016, and is divided into six sections:

1. Key findings of regulatory audits at audited entities by sector.
2. Key findings of performance audits
3. Issues with suspected corruption and actions taken.
4. Key recommendations that help correct performance.
5. Follow up to recommendations.
6. Feedback from audited entities to reports of the Bureau.

**Chapter (II)** lists summary audit reports by audit sector. **Chapter (III)** presents key achievements and non-audit activities such as institutional building, capacity development, public relations and resources of the Bureau.

The Bureau has given 114 reports in 2016, along with 3 environment audit reports and 2 information technology audit reports. The Bureau was present at 368 bidding sessions in its capacity as an observer (preventive audit), and received 485 complaints in 2016 plus 80 received in 2015, of which 463 complaints have been followed up, or %82 of total complaints and complaints referred from 2015. Cases referred to Anti Corruption Commission in 2016 reached 24, of which 18 files were referred upon its request.

Despite that calculating financial impact of audit reports is approved by some entities as feasibility measurement basis for actions of the Bureau, the latter –driven by strategy– does not look at financial impact as the most important benchmark of action

measurement, but rather depends on improvement introduced by audit reports to efficient, effective and economic management of public funds, as well as output delivered by these reports in making a difference to lives of citizens, through improving public services.

**Key financial/administrative misstatements and observations, public issues disclosed by audits that involve legal violation in general, incompetent management or public fund wasting at audited entities were taken from audit reports given in 2016, and sorted out by the following audit sectors:**

## **I. Economy**

The economy sector in Palestine has been audited in 2016 (Ministry of Finance with respective departments, related ministries, Palestine Investment Fund with subsidiary companies), where 8 reports were made and 32 complaints have been followed up. **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- There was suspected manipulation in financial statements of the **Jaba' Electricity Company**, deduced through reduction of revenues and expenses, and failure to show them in the income statements.
- Poor control procedures in the management of banderoles by the excise and tobacco department, Ministry of Finance, during 2012, which caused high risk that could be illegally used by all parties (staff, tobacco factories, presses). There are not technical specifications or controls for the banderoles to prevent falsification. There is no control over volumes of banderole at presses.
- Some board members at some public institutions failed to hold the minimum meetings during the year, which affected governance at these institutions and effectiveness of boards in undertaking tasks entrusted. There are also obvious difference in amount disbursed to board members, where awards have been unduly paid as they did not attend board meetings. It has also been noticed that number of board meetings decreased at institutions that do not pay awards to board members.
- **Ministry of Finance** illegally paid from financial reserves for some expenses that are not in agreement with nature and essence of financial reserves, and are not in agreement with conditions for spending from these reserves for the benefit of staff at the Ministry, some responsibility centers and for individuals with regulatory or official positions. This called into question the integrity and transparency of spending and public funds management, and led to undue losses from the Treasury at 10,093,115 NIS.
- There are not clear standards to determine basis of eligible institutions to receive government subsidy from **general budget allocation**, as well as methods for spending this subsidy, which undermines transparency and integrity of selecting entities subsidized from the budget.
- Amounts have been lost from the Treasury as a result of granting **investment exemptions** that do not fulfill required conditions. There are not any control and follow up to adherence of companies receiving investment exemptions to conditions, so it is

- possible they violate exemption conditions and change nature of activities, unlike decree law 2/2011 on amendment of the investment promotion law in Palestine 1/1998.
- %77 of the **Capital Market Authority** revenues is spent as staff benefits. Allowances and salaries were paid to some staff members unlike employment contracts and the salary/allowance scale approved by the Authority.
  - **Capital Market Authority** failed to take necessary actions against insolvent insurance companies. The Authority violated some provisions of the insurance law 20/2005, which rendered these companies unable to pay liabilities to others, , affected action sustainability and brought high risk regarding guarantee/retain rights and interests of clients.
  - Financial performance of **the women fund, PECDAR** in 2014 has been categorized as 'poor', where effectiveness of loaning programs and ability to recycle loans were low. There was risk to influence sustainability of the fund as a result of operational losses brought by insufficient revenues to cover expenses of the year.
  - Poor financial performance of the **National Information Technology Institute, PECDAR**, where accumulated deficit until end of 2014 reached 343,778 USD, which affects sustainability of the Institute.
  - Poor management and organization, and continued huge losses from the Treasury at **Petroleum Authority** as a result of substantial variations (deficit) in balances of some fuels, between actual balance and book balance entered into financial software 'BISAN'.
  - Shortcomings and poor actions taken by competent entities fighting tax evasion of freelance professionals, and poor follow up to tax files by Ministry of Finance.
  - Poor management of the 'Palestine Green' project, Ministry of Agriculture, reflected by lack of objectives, measurement indicators and enough information on increase of green patches contributed by the project, size of target geographical area and proper seedlings needed, both in quality and quantity.

## II. Governance (civil, security)

The governance audit department gave 15 reports in 2016 as a result of audits undertaken at security sector (sovereign ministries, security agencies, courts). **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- **Risk premium** has been paid to staff who –by nature of actions- are not directly exposed to risks or infections, which incorporated wasting of public funds.
- There have been violations to the **diplomatic corps** law 13/2005 and respective executive regulations, and failure to observe presidential decision regarding promotion of the diplomatic corps staff, and salary payment to wives of embassies staff.
- There has been violation to the **regular court** fees law 1/2003, regarding variations between fees required as per law and actual amounts paid to court registers.
- There was suspected misappropriation at the **register of Tubas court** (manipulation of receipts used to collect fees and fines).
- Poor controls and procedures taken to follow up collection of traffic fines given in 2015 by the **general traffic department, Palestinian Police**, in terms of lack of a

method to ensure validity of data entry into the system, a number of fines are missing and others canceled. Value of fines was reduced by **Palestinian courts** despite that some have been sentenced *in absentia* without objection. Judges and public prosecutors have been exempted from paying traffic fines, and there were fines closed in 'MIZAN' software as paid, but without receipts.

- There has been violation to the Basic Law, the general budget law and the cabinet decision 335/2005, where lawyers were recruited at **Ministry of Jerusalem Affairs** through direct contracting, without advertisements, competitions and selection by a special committee. Term of contracts has been exceeded, and lawyers were contracted to follow up cases of lands, evictions, settlements and confiscations in Jerusalem (inside separation wall) despite there is a government entity for that purpose (Wall & Settlements Resisting Authority).
- There are confiscated items that have been in the **customs police** warehouses for years without taking any action thereto, and there are some items that have been totally damaged despite missing portions of these items were evidenced in inventory minutes.
- Poor follow up and inspection by **civil defense** to fuel stations regarding general safety conditions, and insufficient number of civil defense stations to cover some areas.

### III. Social & Cultural Services

The social and cultural services audit department gave 14 reports and followed up 88 complaints in 2016 as a result of audits undertaken at social and cultural services sector.

#### **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- There was contradiction in the application of effective (void), ineffective and applicable **health insurance** systems, which led to different health insurance premiums and different contribution to these systems, and caused the loss of financial impact to Ministry of Health, the state or beneficiaries.
- There was misuse of **government health insurance** for treatment abroad, where the cost of referrals abroad for health insurance beneficiaries (unions sector) reached 119,781,606 NIS, or %25 of total cost. Percentage of beneficiaries from this sector is only %6, where revenues generated from unions insurance, 2014 reached only 213,998 NIS, or hardly %0.5 of the cost of referrals abroad.
- Poor control carried out by **Ministry of Health** over procedures of granting government health insurance by other institutions, which means that health insurance was given to ineligible people, and that other people enjoyed health insurance services despite they do not pay fees and with insurance term expired.
- **Ministry of Health** violated the civil service law when it carried out appointments without observing laws and regulations in this regard, which caused unequal competition and many applicants were denied the right to be appointed.
- Poor credibility: some persons were appointed in **Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health** on disability despite there was nothing to prove percentage of disability or there was lack of medical reports. Appointments were made without ensuring credibility of medical reports presented by applicants, where it was proved there were contradicted medical reports showing percentage and nature of disability.

- Some resident physicians failed to be present at hospitals wards where they should be, which caused delayed medical treatment to patients and lack of anesthetists at some hospitals.
- Poor methods at some **hospitals** to ensure that holders of health insurance companies are the same people benefiting from health services, which led to some legal circumvention cases through the misuse of health insurance cards.
- There was qualified opinion to financial statements of **Ministry of Education**, 2014 due to failure to set bank reconciliations and approvals and clarifications necessary to audit, besides variations in the trial balance, failure to close advances in due course and failure to close previous fiscal years. Moreover, there was huge deviation in the execution of development budget and projects financed by Ministry of Finance and Joint Finance Partners of **Ministry of Education**. Deviation reached %70, which affected the execution of strategic plan and commitments of donors to the Ministry, and indicated poor planning at the Ministry.
- Poor credibility: There were many errors in data entry of applicants to education posts, **Ministry of Education**, in addition to lack of control, which affected their right to be appointed. Additionally, some applicants to education posts, **Ministry of Education** have been appointed without observing order of applicants, and without observing approved basis and criteria of appointment.
- Poor follow up and supervision procedures, Ministry of Education for **private schools** at some districts in terms of low number of regular inspection visits for health and education conditions, building safety and observing laws and regulations. Furthermore, there was poor supervision by **Ministry of Education** to nutrition at government and non-government schools, as well as the **Ministry of Health** failure to carry out comprehensive nutrition inspections at schools since 2012.
- Poor hajj management: it turned out that %25 of pilgrims who went to 2015 hajj season were not chosen by draws, and that %70 of special cases were selected upon recommendation of external entities, and were not illnesses.
- There was discrimination and inequality upon dealing with pilgrims, where hajj fees were refunded to Ministry staff who went to hajj.
- Poor control procedures over collection and disbursement of **hajj fees** in 2015, poor internal controls over pilgrims draws/registration software and lack of clear basis to select guides of Palestinian pilgrims in 2015.
- Poor control by **Ministry of Waqf & Religious Affairs** over construction, maintenance and expansion of mosques, and over fundraising to ensure they are used in designated purposes.

#### **IV. Infrastructure**

The infrastructure audit department gave 15 reports and followed up 44 complaints in 2016 as a result of audits undertaken at infrastructure sector. **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- Lack of good governance and management for some decisions made by the previous board of the Palestinian Pension Authority, and lack of binding, approved and documented mechanism to board members to disclose and reduce conflict of interest.
- Palestinian Pension Authority failed to collect fees from Palestinian security personnel benefiting from pension system, which might lead to inability to fulfill commitments and sustainability.
- The Palestinian Pension Authority violated general provisions of the law and regulations stating that any legal rule shall be effective immediately, not retroactive, when an additional salary was paid to head of Authority, and retroactively paid to the previous head.
- Lack of good governance in actions of the Palestinian Fund for Employment & Social Protection, due to inability to enforce accountability among members of the board and executive council, since members of the latter are also board members.
- Previous head of Palestine Broadcast Corporation booked flight tickets for people not legally associated, and without justifications and corroborations.
- Lack of legal organization at Palestinian Airways, which brought ambiguous legal status in terms of independence and subordination, in addition to illegal payment of additional salary to staff without justifications.
- Internal control and follow up procedures in Land Authority are poor. They use hardcopy land registration documents, which are prone to damage and modification.
- Land Authority failed to take all legal procedures necessary to collect debts generated by revenues of state properties renting.
- Defect planning by stakeholders of state buildings management, which might affect taking proper decisions in terms of state buildings procurement/renting.
- Lack of clear approved policy by Ministry of Transport to ensure proper procedures to give driving licenses.
- Poor management/organization: poor use of al-Qasr Hotel resources, which generated accumulated losses.
- Poor procedures for government buildings construction: poor planning and coordination among stakeholder, and lack of clear approved criteria for selection of government buildings (owned and rented), which caused procurement and renting of government buildings that do not fit nature, existing size and expected staff raise in institutions.

## V. Local Government

The local government audit department gave 43 reports and followed up 106 complaints in 2016 as a result of audits undertaken at 51 local government entities (municipalities, local/village councils and joint service councils). **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- Poor control and accountability for actions of some local government entities, which increased cases of credit abuse, public funds misuse and monopolized decision making.

- Poor evidence for financial transactions at some local government entities through a documenting cycle, lack of necessary corroborating documents and lack of credibility thereto.
- There were deviations in budget execution at many local government entities, besides inaccurate setting and estimation of income/expense items.
- Poor procedures taken by many local government entities to reduce water and electricity losses, inspect reasons and handle them, whilst water crisis is exacerbating in many areas.
- Suspected manipulation and fraud in data and records of some local government entities, all to conceal financial deficit or exploit the financial variations for personal interest.
- Poor ability of local government entities to fulfill commitments and provide various high quality service to the public due to delinquency in collecting fees/taxes, and failure to take decisive procedures to collect revenues and debts accumulated on taxpayers, which greatly increased these amounts as well as indebtedness of these entities, and rendered them unable to pay. Some of them incurred huge losses as delay fines brought by failure to pay debts.
- Some local government entities gave discounts and exemptions to due fees and some services, unlike regulating laws and without legal justification or approvals necessary from official entities, which caused loss of funds and increased financial insolvency.
- There was spending beyond authorities of local government entities without budget allocations, and without approval from Ministry of Local Government. Most of them spend for government schools and pay rent for government buildings out of their budget, which incurs them additional financial losses.
- Appointments, promotions and bonuses in some local government entities lacked transparency and integrity.
- Poor controls and data security for prepaid systems and accounting software applied by some local government entities, so they were prone to manipulation, wasting and misuse.
- Misuse of position for financial or moral benefit by some members and heads of local government entities.
- Unequal distribution of projects undertaken by some local government entities at level of entire entity, besides lack of clear, approved and declared criteria for selection and execution.
- There were random building and increased violations unto public streets at some local government entities, due to poor adherence to all provisions of the building and planning regulations, regarding licenses granted to buildings and constructions, field examination and complete license files, especially the ones that set fees, legal clearance and collection of necessary insurances.

## VI. NGOs

The NGOs audit department gave 19 reports and followed up 65 complaints in 2016 as a result of audits undertaken at NGOs. **Key audit findings are as follows:**

- Lack of legal framework regulating actions of **NGOs Commission**, which determines and specifies tasks and authorities, besides poor performance of Commission actions due to lack of concrete results for coordinating and organizing actions of NGOs.
- **NGOs Commission** faked office hours records for some staff members presented to General Personnel Council, despite their names appeared in records set by the Commission or its branches, and without evidence to proof they were on the job.
- Poor performance of boards and general assemblies at some NGOs.
- Poor performance of all tasks/responsibilities of competent ministries regarding follow up to NGOs actions, as per associations law 1/2000 and executive regulations.
- **Independent Commission of Human Rights** paid monthly salaries for some general commissioners and bonuses, without legal justification that allows payment of salary or wage for actions of the general commissioner.
- Poor adherence of the **Palestinian Housing Council** to all policies and procedures of loan management, in terms of credit status of borrowers, sufficient guarantees, follow up to construction, loans reschedule/closure and poor collection and follow up by loans department.
- Suspected conflict of interest and personal profiteering by some NGOs board members.
- Poor adherence of the **Palestinian Association of Certified Public Accountants** to some provisions of profession practicing law 9/2004 and respective executive regulations, and to observe instructions thereto, which caused poor organization and control of auditor profession.
- Poor controls over payment of salaries and bonuses, and inaccurate calculation thereto at some NGOs, in addition to poor project management by some NGOs, which led to many financial violations and funds wasting.
- Poor financial/administrative organization for actions of unions that have been audited in 2016, with resulting financial/administrative observations.
- Clear shortcomings in the management of internal income of NGOs, inaccurate recording and failure to follow up collection, especially for NGOs in education and health sectors.

## VII. Legal Affairs & public Complaints

The Bureau received 485 public complaints in 2016, plus 80 complaints referred from 2015, which included public complaints on violations and negligence of public duty performance, in addition to reports published by the media on negligence, misuse of position and mismanagement, of which 463 complaints have been followed up (%82 of total complaints received and complaints referred from 2015).

The legal affairs and public complaints department and competent audit departments followed them up by subject and nature, where related and competent entities have been communicated regarding the follow up findings. A number of reports has been released as appropriate, others were referred to the Anti Corruption Commission as they involved corruption suspicions.

128 legal consultations have been offered, and observations were presented to council of ministers general secretariat regarding 53 draft laws and regulations of different ministries.

## **VIII. Tenders**

The Bureau was present at 368 tender meetings, central bidding committees as an observer in 2016, and they included central biddings of Ministry of public Works, general supplies department, local government entities and various state departments.

## **Recommendations**

**The Bureau recommends the following in order to enhance transparency and integrity of public funds management, reduce risk, raise public performance and improve action procedures:**

- Take proper legal actions against those found guilty of the misuse of public funds, and follow up retrieval of public funds lost from audited entities.
- All audited entities are required to observe provisions of effective laws, regulations and instructions, deal with all violations and observations mentioned in the report and correct them in order to raise public performance and bring public interest.
- Enhance internal control systems and control procedures for all activities and tasks undertaken.
- Follow up the setting of legislations that regulate actions of entities so as to determine tasks/authorities, and approvals by competent entities.
- Regulate and control print of banderoles by Ministry of Finance through approving technical specifications and controls that thwart fraud or manipulation.
- Ministry of Finance is required to enhance follow up to taxpayers, and take legal actions against all tax evaders
- Develop unified system for actions of boards of directors to ensure effectiveness and enhance governance.
- Regulate and control management of fuel warehouses, Ministry of Finance to ensure optimal use of resources.
- Approve clear system and criteria to determine eligibility of institutions to receive government subsidy from the general budget, in order to enhance transparency and integrity of selecting the entities to be subsidized.
- Follow up insurance companies operating in Palestine, calculate margin of solvency regularly, take measures against insolvent companies to ensure payment of liabilities to others and measure sustainability to ensure rights and interests of clients.
- Observe decisions of council of ministers regarding risk premiums paid to eligible people.

- Increase controls over traffic fines in cooperation with all stakeholders.
- Regulate methods followed to grant health insurance to all groups, and increase control procedures over granting by all stakeholders.
- Observe applicable laws and regulations in terms of appointments and promotions to ensure transparency, integrity and equal opportunities among applicants.
- Observe justice, equality, transparency and integrity upon selection of pilgrims and hajj guides, and through clear approved procedures and criteria.
- Ministry of Waqf is required to follow up construction, maintenance and expansion of mosques, supervise fundraising, ensure documenting duly and ensure spending to designated purposes.
- Enhance good governance of local government entities to ensure good performance and optimal use of resources.
- Local government entities are required to work harder in order to reduce losses from water and electricity networks.
- Collect all revenues and fees within powers of local government entities, enforce revenue collection, follow up collection of debts and take legal measures against people failed to pay.
- Raise reliability level of internal control systems to protect assets against misuse of credit and theft, and develop internal regulations to reduce manipulation of financial statements and the risk of position misuse.
- Provide necessary safety and protection measures for accounting software and central database mainframes.
- Control and follow up office hours, prevent functional duplicity and take necessary procedures against staff who fail to observe office hours as per provisions of civil service law and respective executive regulations.
- NGOs are required to organize and correct legal and regulatory conditions, and observe internal regulations.
- NGOs and different unions are required to set sufficient and proper financial/administrative regulations to organize financial and administrative actions, and set adequate controls to regulate revenues and expenses properly.
- Competent ministries and boards of directors are required to follow up, supervise and control actions of NGOs.